A Practical Guide to Shared Governance in a Crisis

Irene Mulvey
Fairfield University

Greg Scholtz
Joerg Tiede
National AAUP
Welcome to: A Practical Guide to Shared Governance in a Crisis

• The presentation portion of the webinar will be in three parts:

1. We will provide an overview of the AAUP’s **recommended standards for academic governance.**

2. We will review **relevant research** highlighting the standard roles that faculty play throughout US higher education.

3. We will provide lots of **practical ideas for actions** you can take on your campus to organize faculty around AAUP principles and ensure that the faculty voice is heard.

• Following the presentations, there will be **breakout sessions** led by members of the AAUP’s Committee on College and University Governance.
Statement on Government of Colleges and Universities

• Since its founding, the AAUP has advocated for meaningful participation of the faculty in institutional decision-making.

• The authoritative formulation of principles of shared governance is the Statement on Government of Colleges and Universities.

• That statement was jointly formulated with the Association of Governing Boards and the American Council on Education.

• The AGB recently affirmed that “specific reference” to the Statement on Government “in the institution’s governing documents is an important foundation” for the institutional commitment to shared governance.
Statement on Government of Colleges and Universities

- Is not intended “as a blueprint for governance.”

- Contains principles that can “lead to the correction of existing weaknesses and assist in the establishment of sound structures and procedures.”

- Has been supplemented over the years by a series of derivative policy statements.
Statement on Government of Colleges and Universities

• The relationship between institutional components calls for **adequate communication** among these components, and full opportunity for **appropriate joint planning and effort**.

• “**Distinction** should be observed between the institutional system of **communication** and the system of **responsibility** for the making of decisions.”
Statement on Government of Colleges and Universities

Recommends “shared” or “joint” governance because

“a college or university in which all the components are aware of their interdependence, of the usefulness of communication among themselves, and of the force of joint action will enjoy increased capacity to solve educational problems.”
Statement on Government of Colleges and Universities

Calls for shared responsibility among the different components of institutional government and specifies areas of primary responsibility for governing boards, administrations, and faculties, because

“The *variety* and *complexity* of the tasks performed by institutions of higher education produce an *inescapable interdependence* among governing board, administration, faculty, students, and others.”
“However cumbersome faculty consultation may at times be, the importance and value of such participation become even greater in exigent times than in more tranquil times. The imperative that affected faculties be consulted and assume a meaningful role in making critical judgments reflects more than the values of collegiality; given the centrality of university faculties in the mission of their institutions, their meaningful involvement in reviewing and approving measures that vitally affect the welfare of the institution ... becomes truly essential at such times. ... [A]n institution cannot be rebuilt on mistrust or worse on a broadly shared sense of betrayal. Action that manifests regard for the faculty’s collective role is essential in order to rebuild commitment and trust.”
Statement on Government of Colleges and Universities

Appropriate joint planning and effort means all components get to participate:

“Important areas of action involve at one time or another the initiating capacity and decision-making participation of all the institutional components.”
Statement on Government of Colleges and Universities

Appropriate joint planning and effort requires participation depending on the degree of responsibility:

“Differences in the weight of each voice, from one point to the next, should be determined by reference to the responsibility of each component for the particular matter at hand.”
On the Role of the Governing Board

- Possesses **final** decision-making authority.
- “The board should undertake **appropriate self-limitation.**”
- While “maintaining a **general overview,**” it
  - **entrusts** the conduct of administration to the administrative officers.
  - **entrusts** the conduct of teaching and research to the faculty.
On the Role of the President

• “The president’s work is to plan, to organize, to direct, and to represent.”
• Ensures that there is “effective communication” between components of the institution.
• Ensures that the operation of the institution “conforms to the policies set forth by the governing board and to sound academic practice.”
• Should be “equally qualified” to serve both as the executive officer of the governing board and as the chief academic officer of the institution and the faculty.
• Should have the confidence of the board and the faculty.
Essentially, the faculty has responsibility (voice and decision-making authority) for matters in proportion to the degree of its expert knowledge. Therefore . . .
On the Role of the Faculty

“The faculty has primary responsibility for such fundamental areas as curriculum, subject matter and methods of instruction, research, faculty status, and those aspects of student life which relate to the educational process.”
On the Role of the Faculty

“Faculty status and related matters are *primarily a faculty responsibility*; this area includes appointments, reappointments, decisions not to reappoint, promotions, the granting of tenure, and dismissal.”
What does “primary responsibility” really mean?

“On these matters the power of review or final decision lodged in the governing board or delegated by it to the president should be exercised adversely only in exceptional circumstances, and for reasons communicated to the faculty. It is desirable that the faculty should, following such communication, have opportunity for further consideration and further transmittal of its views to the president or board.”
What does “primary responsibility” really mean?

In areas of faculty primacy, boards and presidents should “concur with the faculty judgment except in rare instances and for compelling reasons which should be stated in detail.”
On Representation and Confidentiality in Governance

• “Faculty representatives should be selected by the faculty according to procedures determined by the faculty.”

• Faculty bodies should establish expectations for conduct of faculty representatives: at a minimum, faculty representatives need to inform their constituents and seek their input.

• The use of confidentiality agreements or mandates as a condition for participation in shared governance is incompatible with serving as a faculty representative.
Statement on Government of Colleges and Universities

In areas where the faculty doesn’t have primary responsibility, the faculty still participate in decision-making. These areas include

✓ Long range planning
✓ Hiring and evaluation of administrators
✓ Physical plant
✓ Budget
The Role of the Faculty in Budgetary and Salary Matters

• “The faculty should participate both in the preparation of the total institutional budget and ... in decisions relevant to the further apportioning of its specific fiscal divisions.”

• “[A]n elected representative committee of the faculty [should] participate[] in deciding on the overall allocation of institutional resources and the proportion to be devoted directly to the academic program.”

• “Budgetary decisions directly affecting those areas for which, according to the Statement on Government, the faculty has primary responsibility ... should be made in concert with the faculty.”
Role of the Faculty in Conditions of Financial Exigency

• “There should be early, careful, and meaningful faculty involvement in decisions relating to the reduction of instructional and research programs. The financial conditions that bear on such decisions should not be allowed to obscure the fact that instruction and research constitute the essential reasons for the existence of the university.”

• “Judgments determining where within the overall academic program termination of appointments may occur involve considerations of educational policy, including affirmative action, as well as of faculty status, and should therefore be the primary responsibility of the faculty or of an appropriate faculty body.”
Governance Principles and Surveys

- AAUP principles on academic freedom and tenure are **highly specific** and intended to be adopted with **very little variation**.
- AAUP principles on shared governance are much more **general** and expected to be implemented **in a variety of ways**, depending on size, mission, control, history, etc., of the institution.
- Given the wide variation in governance practices, there has been a **longstanding** interest in using **surveys** to investigate these practices.
- Governance surveys can address two different questions: **how prevalent** are certain kinds of practices and **how closely** do institutions adhere to AAUP governance principles?
Faculty Governance Areas

**Academic**
- Curricular decisions
- Degree requirements
- Degrees offered

**Personnel**
- Faculty appointments
- Conferral of tenure
- Salary scales
- Individual salaries

**Administrative**
- Allocation of positions
- Buildings
- Teaching loads
- Dean selection
- Chair selection
- Faculty governance authority
- Faculty representatives
- Budget planning
A Hierarchy of Levels of Faculty Participation

- **Determination**: Determination means that the faculty have **final** legislative or operational **authority**.
- **Joint Action**: Joint action means that **formal** agreement by **both** the faculty and other components of the institution is **required**.
- **Consultation**: Consultation means that there is a **formal** procedure which provides a **means** for the faculty to present its **judgment** in the form of a recommendation or vote.
- **Discussion**: Discussion means that there is only an **informal** expression of **opinion** from the faculty or from individual faculty members.
- **None**: None means that there is **no** faculty participation.
Practical ideas for actions you can take on your campus to organize faculty around AAUP principles and ensure that the faculty voice is heard.
Get a copy of The Redbook.

Get copies for chapter members.

Get copies to faculty senators, department chairs, Handbook Committee chairs

Get copies to AVP, Provost, key administrators.

Get copies to Board members, Chairs of key Board Committees

https://www.aaup.org/reports-publications/publications/publications/redbook
Disseminate the Statement on Government:
- To chapter members
- To faculty colleagues (members-to-be)
- To faculty serving in governance
- To AVP, Provost, key administrators
- To Board chair, Board members, key Board Committee Chairs

Post on bulletin boards.
Print in a newsletter (regularly).

*Emphasize its recent re-endorsement by the AGB.*

Key Takeaway

The first and best line of defense is an institution’s own faculty.

- Form an AAUP chapter on your campus.
- Strengthen and grow an existing AAUP chapter.
- Appreciate the power of collective action.
We are educated and armed with AAUP principles. We have allies. What do we do now?

- Long-term: Improving governance
- Short-term: Effectively using governance
Long-term: Improving governance
With your allies/faculty body/chapter,

- Analyze the governance structure on your campus. What are the strengths and weaknesses of the current system?
- Compare your governance structure with the standards set by the 1966 *Statement on Government* and other AAUP statements.
- Compare your governance structure with those of universities known for good practices.
- Hold public forums on governance with both campus and outside speakers.
- Seek opportunities to discuss governance with your administration and governing board.
- Develop a plan. Decide whether to attempt an overall redoing of your governance system or to attack it piecemeal.
Long-term: Improving governance
Necessities that follow from the *Statement on Government*

- Make sure standing faculty committees exist for all key areas that involve academic decisions.
- Establish shared governance at all levels of the university—department, college/school, and university.
- Make sure faculty appointments to all committees are made by faculty.
- As noted earlier, establish expectations for conduct of faculty representatives. At a minimum, faculty representatives need to inform their constituents and seek their input.
- As noted earlier, reject the use of confidentiality agreements as a condition for participation in shared governance.
- Question the advisability of mixed committees in areas of faculty primacy.
- Avoid the use of ad-hoc committees (“task forces”), especially those established unilaterally by the administration and/or the governing board.
Long-term: Improving governance
Inclusion of all faculty is essential

- Institutional policies should define as “faculty” and include in governance bodies at all levels individuals whose appointments consist primarily of teaching or research activities conducted at a professional level.

- Eligibility for voting and holding office in institutional governance bodies should be the same for all faculty regardless of full- or part-time status.

- Ideally there should be no minimum or maximum number of seats reserved in institutional governance bodies where representation of contingent faculty is appropriate.

- All faculty members, regardless of their status or appointment type, should, in the conduct of governance activities, be explicitly protected by institutional policies from retaliation in the form of discipline, non-reappointment, dismissal, or any other adverse action.
Long-term: Improving governance
On faculty communication with the Board

- Every standing committee of the governing board, including the executive committee, should include a faculty representative.

- Direct communication between the faculty and the governing board should occur through a liaison or conference committee consisting only of faculty members and trustees and meeting regularly to discuss topics of mutual interest.

- New faculty representatives to the governing board should participate in orientation for new trustees. topics of mutual interest.
Long-term: Improving governance
Be sure to keep in mind that...

• Governance reform is a slow process.
• A governance document is never perfect.
• Shared governance will work only if faculty members are willing to devote the needed time and effort.
• Good communication is essential.
• Effective shared governance requires mutual trust and respect.
Effectively using governance: Exercising Power
THE FACULTY HAS TO MAKE ITS POSTION KNOWN TO THE ADMINISTRATION!

- The faculty can pass a motion at a faculty meeting.
- The faculty can take a vote.
- An elected faculty body can send a letter.

*Mention AAUP policies and standards whenever possible.*

- The chapter/faculty can write a petition and collect signatures.
- The chapter/faculty can deliver a letter/petition in a group.
- The chapter/faculty can hold a protest.
Think strategically (short-term and long-term) about what’s best for the teaching and research mission of the institution. Work collectively with your faculty colleagues and in chapter meetings to figure out what’s needed and a course of action.

Examples:

MOTION. Curriculum and methods of instruction are matters over which the faculty has primary responsibility. The General Faculty’s position is that decisions on these matters must be made and approved at the department or program level.

MOTION. The health and safety of students, faculty, and staff should be the primary consideration in decision-making about when to reopen our campus. [Our school’s administration] should provide reasonable accommodations for any member of the campus community who has an underlying health condition. Faculty members should not have to reveal sensitive medical or personal information in order to request an accommodation to teach remotely in the Fall.

MOTION. [The administration] should compensate contingent faculty members for the unexpected additional labor of converting courses to remote/online platforms.
Think strategically (short-term and long-term) about what’s best for the teaching and research mission of the University. Work collectively with your faculty colleagues and in chapter meetings to figure out what’s needed, and a course of action.

Examples:
In this white paper/newsletter, we [the AAUP chapter at your institution] outline AAUP principles and standards that are applicable to the educational problems that have arisen on our campus as a result of the COVID-19 global pandemic.

The University of Akron is on fire from COVID and incompetent administrators. **THE UNIVERSITY IS THE FACULTY.**
Please sign our petition:
... 4. Reduce the number and pay of high-ranking managers with fabricated titles who create unnecessary administrative work + need more assistants. Divert the money from those salaries to hire e-learning support staff + to save the jobs of at-risk adjuncts. Pam Schulze, president of the University of Akron Chapter of the American Association of University Professors, agrees the university could show good faith by accepting deeper cuts among top administrators.

See: [https://www.aaup.org/news/statement-racial-justice-higher-education#.Xv_FtvJ7nrl](https://www.aaup.org/news/statement-racial-justice-higher-education#.Xv_FtvJ7nrl)
See: [https://www.aaup.org/issues/coronavirus-resources](https://www.aaup.org/issues/coronavirus-resources)
Effectively using governance: exercising power
The faculty has to make its position known to the administration.

Fairfield University works because Fairfield faculty work.

I support the FSC.

Social Justice begins at home.
I support Local 30.
KEEP WORK IN HOUSE.

I SUPPORT THE FSC
Attracting and retaining high-quality faculty to maintain Fairfield’s commitment to excellence in education requires first and foremost fair and reasonable increases to salary and robust, comprehensive benefits.

SALARY INCREASE! NO BENEFIT CUTS!
Effectively using governance: exercising power

- Stand on AAUP principles
- Make the faculty’s position known to the administration.
- Mention AAUP principles and standards whenever possible.
- Insist that the administration respond to the faculty’s position.

- Coordinate all of your efforts with organizing.
- Take your actions back to the faculty to grow and strengthen your chapter.
Be prepared to counter misconceptions about governance:

• Shared governance is not the idea that all important decisions are put to the entire faculty for a vote.

• Shared governance is not the idea that a lot of conversation ought to take place within and among various campus groups—board, administration, faculty, staff, students, etc.—before the people in power make the final decision.

• Shared governance is not the idea that each of the various campus groups have exclusive authority over different areas of decision making.
Do not accept “stakeholder” arguments for governance:

• A “stakeholder” version of shared governance assumes (incorrectly) that for important issues, all decision-making power belongs to the board and the administration.

• It assumes (incorrectly) that all campus constituencies are pretty much equal, regardless of function and expertise.
Be prepared for administrative pushback:

Shared governance is not limited faculty participation only when times are good.

“Relevant AAUP-supported policies—most notably those that recognize the special challenge of ‘financial exigency’—are sufficiently broad and flexible to accommodate even the inconceivable disaster. These policies have, in fact, been successfully invoked (as documented through AAUP experience) by institutions in situations that, while perhaps not matching the gravity of those in New Orleans in fall 2005, surpassed in severity those imagined” by the authors of these policies.

(From the Report of an AAUP Special Committee: Hurricane Katrina and New Orleans Universities.)
Academic Governance best practices:

- All voices are **not** equal in institutional governance.
- The faculty exercises “primary responsibility” in areas of expert knowledge.
- Administration/board normally concur with faculty recommendations regarding areas where faculty have primary responsibility. That is, the administration/board concur “except in rare instances and for compelling reasons which should be stated in detail.”
Academic Governance best practices:

• In other words, in academic matters, a faculty decision should normally be a final decision.
• In other words, administration/board should maintain a hands-off policy with regard to any academic matter: curriculum, academic policies, appointment, reappointment, non-reappointment, tenure, promotion.
Ways an AAUP Chapter can exercise power and promote meaningful faculty governance:

• Support and cooperate with faculty governance bodies.
• Get chapter members involved in faculty governance.
• Hold faculty governance bodies accountable.
• Publish a newsletter.
• Communicate with the administration and board.
• Sponsor meetings and hold forums.
• Maintain a website.
• Administer a governance climate survey.
• Advocate for regular evaluation of administrators.
• Seek the advice of the AAUP national staff and AAUP leaders.
• Be a force to be reckoned with.
• Resources on the website:
  • The FAQ on AAUP Principles and Policies for COVID-19
  • AAUP guidance for reopening
  • Policies and Best Practices for Financial Crisis

• AAUP Policy Statements
  • The Role of Faculty in Budgetary and Salary Matters
  • The Role of the Faculty in Conditions of Financial Exigency
  • Confidentiality and Faculty Representation in Academic Governance
  • Faculty Communication with Governing Boards: Best Practices
Thank You!

https://www.aaup.org

https://twitter.com/aaup

https://www.facebook.com/AAUPNational

https://academeblog.org/