

---

## 16. *Psychological Types in the Cultures of the Southwest*

RUTH FULTON BENEDICT (1887-1948)

THE CULTURE OF the Pueblo Indians is strongly differentiated from that of surrounding peoples. Most obviously, all aspects of their life are highly ritualized, highly formalized. No one has lived among them who has not been struck by the importance of the formal detail in rite and dance, the intricate interrelations of the ceremonial organization, the lack of concern with personal religious experience or with personal prestige or exploit. The emphasis in their all-absorbing

ceremonial routine is placed where it was in the medieval Roman church of certain periods, on the formal observance, the ritualistic detail for its own sake.

This is so conspicuously true for the South-west peoples that in descriptions of their culture we have been content to let the matter rest with this characterization. Yet in a civilization such as that of the North American Indians high ritualistic development sets no group off in any

(1930)

Benedict did fieldwork among the Zuni, Cochiti, and Pima throughout the mid-1920s. This paper, presented in 1928, was her first major analysis of her experiences there. In it, she develops themes later elaborated in *Patterns of Culture*, published in 1934. Perhaps because it was designed for a popular audience and written in an

engaging style. *Patterns of Culture* became an enduring classic of anthropology—one still frequently read by students in introductory courses. Despite frequent criticism, Benedict's descriptions of Native American cultures and her theoretical position have had an important effect on American anthropology.

definitive fashion from the vast majority of peoples. The ritual of the sun dance, the peace pipe ceremonies, the cult groups, and age-societies of the Plains, or the winter ceremonial of the Northwest Coast bulk perhaps slightly less prominently in the total life of these people than the calendric dances and retreats of the South-west, but it is not by any such matter of gradation that the Southwest is set off from other American Indian cultures. There is in their cultural attitudes and choices a difference in psychological type fundamentally to be distinguished from that of surrounding regions. It goes deeper than the presence or the absence of ritualism; ritualism itself is of a fundamentally different character within this area, and without the understanding of this fundamental psycho-logical set among the Pueblo peoples we must be baffled in our attempts to understand the cultural history of this region.<sup>1</sup>

It is Nietzsche who has named and de-scribed, in the course of his studies in Greek tragedy, the two psychological types which have established themselves in the region of the Southwest in the cultures of the Pueblo.<sup>2</sup> He has called them the Dionysian and the Apollonian. He means by his classification essentially confidence in two diametrically different ways of arriving at the values of existence.<sup>b</sup> The Dionysian pursues them through "the annihilation of the ordinary bounds and limits of existence"; he seeks to attain in his most valued moments escape from the boundaries imposed upon him by his five senses, to break through into another order of experience. The desire of the Dionysian, in personal experience or in ritual, is to press beyond, to reach a certain psy-

chological state, to achieve excess. The closest analogy to the emotions he seeks is drunkenness, and he values the illuminations of frenzy. With Blake, he believes the path of excess leads to the palace of wisdom." The Apollonian distrusts all this, if by chance he has any inkling of the occurrence of such experiences; he finds means to outlaw them from his conscious life. He "knows but one law, measure in the Hellenic sense." He keeps the middle of the road, stays within the known map, maintains his control over all disruptive psychological states. In Nietzsche's fine phrase, even in the exaltation of the dance, "he remains what he is, and retains his civic name.'

The Southwest Pueblos are, of course, Apollonian, and in the consistency with which they pursue the proper valuations of the Apollonian they contrast with very nearly the whole of aboriginal America. They possess in a small area, islanded in the midst of predominantly Dionysian cultures, an *ethos* distinguished by sobriety, by its distrust of excess, that minimizes to the last possible vanishing point any challenging or dangerous experiences. They have a religion of fertility without orgy, and absorption in the dance without using it to arrive at ecstasy. They have abjured torture. They indulge in no whole-sale destruction of property at death. They have never made or bought intoxicating liquors in the fashion of other tribes about them, and they have never given themselves up to the use of drugs. They have even stripped sex of its mystic danger. They allow to the individual no disruptive role in their social order. Certainly in all of these traits they stand so strikingly over against their neighbors that it is necessary to seek some

<sup>2</sup> Benedict derives her categories of Apollonian and Dionysian from *The Birth of Tragedy* (published in 1872), a study of the origins of Greek drama by German philosopher Friedrich Nietzsche (1844-1900). Some biographers have suggested that Benedict's intellectual preference for this classification scheme was related to her experience as a very young child, when, at her father's open-casket funeral, she experienced the contrast between her mother's open grief and her father's calm, tragic corpse (Modell 1983:1).

The reference is to William Blake (1757-1827), an English poet, painter, and visionary. Benedict, who had studied English literature at Vassar College, was a more artful writer than most anthropologists. In addition to her anthropological works, Benedict wrote poetry under the pen name of Anne Singleton, a name that may be revealing of her personality. Her poems appeared in literary magazines, but she was unable to get a collection of them published. Thankfully for anthropology, her inability to find a publisher for her book dissuaded her from a career in poetry.

explanation for the cultural resistances of the Pueblos.

The most conspicuous contrast, in the Pueblos, is their outlawry of the divine frenzy and the vision. Now in North America at large the value of ecstatic experience in religion is a cornerstone of the whole religious structure. It may be induced by intoxicants and drugs; it may be self-induced-which may include such means as fasting and torture-or it may be achieved in the dance.

We may consider first the ecstasy induced by intoxicants and drugs. For the neighboring Pima, who share the culture of the primitive tribes of northern Mexico, intoxication is the visible mirroring of religion, it is the symbol of its exaltation, the pattern of its mingling of clouded vision and of insight. Theory and practice are explicitly Dionysian.

"And I was made drunk and given the sacred songs;"

"He breathed the red liquor into me,"

are in their songs common forms of reference to the shamanistic experience. Their great ceremony is the drinking of the "tizwin," the fermented juice of the fruit of the giant cactus. The ceremony begins with all religious formality and the recitation of ritual, but its virtue lies in the intoxication itself; the desired state is that of roused excitement, and they accept even extreme violence more readily than a state of lethargy. Their ideal is to stave off the final in-sensibility indefinitely while achieving the full

excitation of the intoxicant. This is of course a form of fertility and health magic and is in complete accord with the Dionysian slant of their culture.

It is much commoner, north of Mexico, to use drugs rather than intoxicants for religious ends. The peyote or mescal bean of northern Mexico has been traded up the Mississippi Valley as far as the Canadian border, and has been the occasion of serious religious movements among many tribes. It gives supernormal experiences with particularly strong affect, no erotic excitation, very often brilliant color images. The cult is best de-scribed for the Winnebago<sup>5</sup> where the peyote is identified with the supernatural. "It is the only holy thing I have been aware of in all my life"; "this medicine alone is holy and has rid me of all evil." It was eaten everywhere with the object of attaining the trance or supernormal sensations which the drug can give. The Arapaho ate it in an all-night ceremony after which the effects of the drug prolonged themselves throughout the following day.<sup>6</sup> The Winnebago speak of eating it for four days and nights without sleep.

The *datura* is a more drastic poison. I have been told by the Serrano<sup>7</sup> and Cahuilla of boys who have died as a result of the drink, and the Luiseno tell also the same story. It was used by the tribes of Southern California, and north including the Yokuts, for the initiation of boys at puberty. Among the Serrano the boys were overcome by the drug (luring the night and lay in a comatose condition through the next day and night, during

<sup>5</sup> Benedict speaks here of seeking explanation for Pueblo Apollonian behavior, but offers none. Benedict saw culture as personality writ large. She believed that societies were able to choose their cultures out of the full range of human variability, but she was not concerned with understanding why a society would choose one type of culture rather than another. Although Benedict's work offered many examples of Pueblo Apollonian behavior, it provided no historical context-she made no attempt to explain the origins of the cultural personalities she documented. The lack of history is surprising, since Franz Boas, her teacher, placed such an emphasis on historical reconstruction. Despite their Boasian backgrounds, culture and personality writers were generally ahistorical.

<sup>6</sup> Benedict's anthropology is psychological, but it is not Freudian. Like other Boasians, she rejected Freud's notions of cultural evolution as nonscientific and ethnocentric. She traced her intellectual descent from the German psychologist Wilhelm Dilthey (1883-1911), who believed that the goal of psychology was to understand the inner life of the mind. He also proposed the existence of different *weltanschauungen*, or worldviews, which were categories much like Benedict's Apollonian and Dionysian cultures.

<sup>7</sup> Although Benedict here mentions her own 1922 study of the Serrano, she did little fieldwork, preferring instead to draw on studies from many sources.

which time they were granted visions. On the following day they ran a race. Among the Luiseno it seems to have been the same, four nights of trance being spoken of as excessive.<sup>7</sup> The Diegueno reckon only one night of complete stupefaction? The Mohave drank *datura* in order to gain luck in gambling; they were said to be unconscious for four days, during which time they received their power in a dream.

None of these alcohol- and drug-induced excitations have gained currency among the Pueblos. The Pima are the nearest settled neighbors of the Zuni to the southwest and easily accessible; tribes of the Plains with which the eastern Pueblos came in contact are the very ones in which peyote practices are important; and to the west the tribes of Southern California share certain characteristic traits of this very Pueblo culture. The absence of these traits in the Pueblos is therefore not due to the cultural isolation of impassable barriers. We know too that the period of time during which the Pueblos and their neighbors have been settled relatively near to one another is of considerable antiquity. But the Pueblos have defended themselves against the use of drugs and intoxicants to produce trance or excitement even in cases where the drugs themselves are known among them. Any Dionysian effect from them is, we may infer, repulsive to the Pueblos, and if they receive cultural recognition at all it is in a guise suited to Apollonian sobriety. They did not themselves brew any native intoxicant in the old days, nor do they now. Alone

among the Indian reservations, the whiskey of the whites has never been a problem in the Southwest. When, in 1912, drinking seemed to be making some headway among the younger generation in Zuni, it was the Pueblo elders themselves who took the matter in hand. It is not that it is a religious taboo; it is deeper than that, it is uncongenial. The peyote has been introduced only in Taos, which is in many ways marginal to Pueblo culture.

*Datura* is used in Zuni as it was in ancient Mexico in order to discover a thief, and Mrs. Stevenson<sup>8</sup> gives an account of the manner of its use.<sup>9</sup> Read in connection with her quotations on *datura* poisoning and the two to four day trances of the Mohave and Mission Indians, it is a classic example of the Apollonian recasting of a Dionysian technique. In Zuni the man who is to take the drug has a small quantity put in his mouth by the officiating priest, who then retires to the next room and listens for the incriminating name from the lips of the man who has taken the *datura*. He is not supposed to be comatose at any time; he alternately sleeps and walks about the room. In the morning he is said to have no memory of the insight he has received. The chief care is to remove every trace of the drug and two common desecrating techniques are employed: first, he is given an emetic, four times, till every vestige of the drug is supposed to be ejected; then his hair is washed in yucca suds. The other Zuni use of *datura* is even further from any connection with a Dionysian technique; members of the

<sup>7</sup> Benedict started her career in ethnology as a student of Elsie Clew Parsons (1875-1941) at the New School for Social Research but soon went to study under Franz Boas at Columbia. After the completion of her dissertation, she remained with Boas until his retirement in 1936; she herself continued at Columbia until her death in 1948. The particularly close relationship between Boas and Benedict gave her exceptional access to the work and friendship of his other students, particularly Sapir, Mead (essay 17), and Kroeber (see essay 10). Both their work, and her conversations and correspondence with them, had a profound influence on Benedict's anthropology. Note the strong reliance on work by Boas, his students, and friends in Benedict's notes to this essay.

<sup>8</sup> Matilda Stevenson (1849-1915) was a pioneering American ethnographer who did extensive fieldwork among the Zuni between 1879 and 1915 and published several monographs on them. Stevenson, founder and first president of the Women's Anthropological Society, was one of the first ethnographers to do work that centered on women and children.

<sup>9</sup> Two aspects of Boasian thought exerted particularly strong influences on Benedict. The first was cultural relativism. Notice that her language describing the use of hallucinogens, an exotic and possibly offensive cultural practice, is matter-of-fact and nonjudgmental. Although Apollonian culture traits might seem more desirable to

priestly orders go out at night to plant prayer sticks on certain occasions "to ask the birds to sing for rain," and at such times a minute quantity of the powdered root is put into the eyes, ears, and mouth of each priest. Here any connections with the physical properties of the drug are lost sight of.

Much more fundamental in North America than any use of drugs or alcohol to induce ecstasy was the cult of the self-induced vision. This was a near-universality from ocean to ocean, and everywhere it was regarded as the source of religious power. The Southwest is by no means beyond the southern limits of its distribution, but it is the one outstanding area of North America where the characteristic development of the vision is not found. This experience has several quite definite characteristics for North America: it is achieved characteristically in isolation, and it gives to the successful individual a personal manitou or guardian spirit who stands to him in a definite life-long relationship. Though west of the Rockies it is often regarded as an involuntary blessing available only for those of a particular psychological make-up, throughout the great extent of the continent it is sought by isolation and fasting, and in the central part of the continent often by self-torture. This "vision," from which supernatural power was supposed to flow, did not by any means signify only supernormal or Dionysian experiences, but it provided always a pattern within which such an experience had peculiar and institutionalized value; and in the great majority of cases it was these more extreme experiences that were believed to give the greater blessing.

The absence of this vision complex in the Southwest is one of the most striking cases of cultural resistance or of cultural reinterpretation that we know in North America. The formal elements are found there: the seeking of dangerous places, the friendship with a bird or animal, fasting, the belief in special blessings from supernatural encounters. But they are no longer instinct with the will to achieve ecstasy. There is complete reinterpretation. In the pueblos they go out at night to feared or sacred places and listen for a voice, not that they may break through to communication with the supernatural, but that they may take the omens of good luck and bad. It is regarded as a minor ordeal during which you are badly frightened, and the great taboo connected with it is that you must not look behind you on the way home no matter what seems to be following you. The objective performance is much the same as in the vision quest; in each case, they go out during the preparation for a difficult undertaking—in the Southwest often a race—and make capital of the darkness, the solitariness, the appearance of animals. But the significance is utterly different.<sup>10</sup>

Fasting, the technique most often used in connection with the self-induced vision, has received the same sort of reinterpretation in the Southwest. It is no longer utilized to dredge up experiences that normally lie below the level of consciousness; it is here a requirement for ceremonial cleanness. Nothing could be more unexpected to a Pueblo Indian than any theory of a connection between fasting and any sort of exaltation. Fasting is required during all retreats, before participation in a dance, in a race, etc., etc., but it is never followed

---

upper-middle-class intellectual Americans (her primary audience), her writing here and in *Patterns of Culture* describes Apollonian and Dionysian cultures as equally attractive.

The second Boasian influence was an emphasis on holism. Boas suggested that cultures were integrated; Benedict pushed this idea further. She saw culture as having internal logical consistency and being characterized by a single dominant trend or pattern. This essay is largely an exercise in the demonstration of the holism that she saw in culture in general and among the Pueblo peoples in particular. Throughout the essay, she tries to show that

---

all Pueblo practices, even the use of hallucinogenic drugs, fit the restrained, Apollonian worldview.

<sup>10</sup> Benedict's focus here is not on the actions performed, but on how the actors interpret their actions. Boas wanted to build anthropology on a scientific, empirical model; Benedict came to see anthropology as an interpretive art, as much a humanity as a social science. At the end of her life, she wrote that anthropology stood at the boundary between science and the humanities (1948:585). This view has made her an important figure for many interpretive and postmodern anthropologists.

by power-giving experience; it is never Dionysian. Fasting, also, like drugs and visions, has been revamped to the requirements of the Apollonian.

Torture, on the contrary, has been much more nearly excluded.<sup>12</sup> It is important only in the initiations and dances of certain curing societies<sup>13</sup> and in these cases there is no suggestion of any states of self-oblivion. It is interesting that the Pueblos have been exposed to self-torture practices, both in the aboriginal culture of the Plains, and in European-derived practices of the Mexican Penitentes.<sup>14</sup> The eastern Pueblos are in the very heart of the Santa Fe Penitentes country and these Mexicans attend their dances and ceremonies regularly and without hindrance. Much in their practice they have in common with the Indians: the retreats in the ceremonial house, the organization of the brotherhood (priesthood, for the Indian), the planting of crosses. But the self-lashing with cactus whips, the crucifixion on Good Friday, are alien; torture has not penetrated Pueblo life either from these practices or from those of the Plains or of California. Among the Pueblos, every man's hand has its five fingers,<sup>15</sup> and unless he has been tortured as a witch, he is unscarred.

No more than the Pueblos have allowed ecstasy as induced by alcohol or drugs, or under the guise of the vision, have they admitted it as induced by the dance. Perhaps no people in North America spend more time in dance than the Southwest Pueblos. But its use as the most direct technique at our command for the inducement of supernormal experience is alien to them. With the frenzy of a Nootka bear dance, of a Kwakiutl cannibal dance, of a ghost dance, of a Mexican whirling (lance, their dancing has nothing in common. It is rather a

technique of monotonous appeal, of unvarying statement; always, in the phrase of Nietzsche's I used before, "they remain as they are and retain their civic names." Their theory seems to be that by the reiteration of the dance they can exercise compulsion upon the forces they wish to influence.

There are several striking instances of the loss, for the Pueblos, of the Dionysian significance of specific dance behavior, the objective aspects of which they still share with their neighbors. The best is probably the dance upon the altar. For the Cora of northern Mexico the climax of the whirling dance is reached in the dancer's ecstatic, and otherwise sacrilegious, dancing upon the ground altar itself. In his madness it is destroyed, trampled into the sand again.<sup>16</sup> But this is also a Pueblo pattern. Especially the Hopi at the climax of their dances in the kivas dance upon the altar destroying the ground painting. Here there is no ecstasy; it is raw material used to build up one of the common Pueblo dance patterns where two "sides" which have previously come out alternately from opposite sides, now come out together for the dance climax. In the snake dance, for instance,<sup>17</sup> in the first set Antelope (dancer of Antelope society) dances, squatting, the circuit of the altar, retires; Snake (dancer of Snake society) repeats. In the second set Antelope receives a vine in his mouth and dances before the initiates trailing it over their knees; retires; Snake repeats with a live rattle-snake held in the same fashion. In the final set Antelope and Snake come out together, dancing together upon the altar, still in the squatting position, and destroy the ground painting. It is a formal sequence, like a Morris dance.<sup>18</sup>

<sup>12</sup> Notice that Benedict offers no reason why the Pueblo have rejected torture. It is simply an aspect of their culture, and culture is an independent force creating itself.

<sup>13</sup> *Penitentes* are individuals who, at Easter, imitate the suffering of Jesus by whipping themselves and imitating his crucifixion.

<sup>14</sup> *Five fingers* refers to a common Plains Indian practice of chopping off a finger joint in mourning or for spiritual purposes.

<sup>15</sup> Critics have frequently accused Benedict of being so guided by her vision of the logical constancy of culture

that she distorted her data. They point out that, Benedict's claims to the contrary, alcoholism was common on the Pueblo reservations during her fieldwork (and is so today). In this passage, Benedict suggests that a dance done with a live rattlesnake in the mouth is not an ecstatic ritual, but rather like a Morris dance, a rather staid and orderly form of British folk dancing. Perhaps so, but this assertion raises important questions of interpretation. Most observers would consider dancing with live rattlesnakes an ecstatic rite. However, few members of any religion would use such words to describe their actions. So, is it or is it not ecstatic? If we accept that dancing with live rattlesnakes is not an ecstatic ritual, does the phrase have any meaning;

It is evident that ecstatic experience is not recognized in the Southwest and that the techniques associated with it in other areas are reinterpreted or refused admittance. The consequence of this is enormous: it rules out shamanism. For the shaman, the religious practitioner whose power comes from experiences of this type, is everywhere else in North America of first rate importance. Wherever the authority of religion is derived from his solitary mental aberrations and stress experiences and his instructions derived therefrom are put into practice by the tribe as a sacred privilege, that people is provided with a technique of cultural change which is limited only by the unimaginateness of the human mind.<sup>5</sup> This is a sufficient limitation; so much so that it has never been shown that cultures which operate on this basic theory are more given to innovation than those which disallow such disruptive influences. This should not blind us to the fact, however, that the setting in these two cultures for the exercise of individuality is quite different; individual initiative which would be fully allowed in the one case<sup>6</sup> would in the other be suspect, and these consequences are fully carried out in the Southwest. They have hardly left space for an impromptu individual act in their closely knit religious program; if they come across such an act they label the perpetrator a witch. One of the Zuni tales I have recorded tells of the chief priest of Zuni who made prayer sticks and went out to deposit them. It was not the time of the moon when prayer sticks must be planted by members of the curing societies, and the people said, "Why does the chief priest plant prayer sticks? He must be conjuring." As a matter of fact he was calling an earthquake for a private

revenge. If this is so in the most personal of Zuni religious acts, that of planting prayer sticks, it is doubly so of more formal activities like re-treats, dances, etc. Even individual prayers of the most personal sort—those where cornmeal is scattered—must be said at sunrise, or over a dead animal, or at a particular point in a program, etc.; the times and seasons are always stipulated. No one must ever wonder why an individual was moved to pray.

Instead therefore of shamans with their disruptive influence upon communal practices and settled traditions, the Southwest has religious practitioners who become priests by rote memorizing and by membership in societies and cult groups. This membership is determined by heredity and by payment<sup>7</sup> for though in their own theory serious illness or an accident like snake bite or being struck by lightning are the accepted reasons for membership in certain societies, there are always alternative ways of joining even the curing societies so that no man with interest and sufficient means remains outside. In Zuni heredity is the chief factor in membership in the priestly groups, payment in the curing societies; in neither is individual supernatural power ever claimed by any member as a result of personal illumination. Those who practice curing in Zuni are merely those who by payment and by knowledge of ritual have reached the highest orders of the curing societies and received the personal corn fetish, the *mili*.

If the ecstasy of the Dionysian has been rejected in the Southwest with all its implications, so too has the orgy.<sup>8</sup> There is no doubt that the idea of fertility bulks large in the religious

---

can any ritual be described as ecstatic? Such issues of interpretation became the subject of intense anthropological debate in the 1950s and 1960s and to some extent remain so today.

<sup>5</sup> Benedict comments in passing on the "unimaginateness of the human mind." Like Boas, Benedict believed that within a culture, most traits originated by diffusion rather than independent invention. However, neither agreed at all with the radical European diffusionist thinkers.

<sup>6</sup> Throughout this essay, but particularly here and below, the examples given are quite sensational; even risqué. This is typical of much of the anthropology of Benedict's time

and, in her case, there were at least two reasons for it. First, she often wrote for a popular audience, and like Freud, Mead, and Malinowski, used the lure of the discussion of forbidden topics such as sex to attract and hold her audience. Second, she was a firm believer in cultural relativism. Showing exotic cultural practices that were unacceptable to her audience in a calm and rational light helped build the case for the acceptance of all cultures as equally valid. In this connection, it should be noted that Benedict practiced what she preached. She was a bitter opponent of racism and a forceful advocate for tolerance within her own society.

practices of the Southwest, and with fertility rites we almost automatically couple orgy, so universally have they been associated in the world. But the Southwest has a religion of fertility founded on other associations. Haeberlin's study gives a useful summary of the type of ritual that is here considered to have this efficacy. The cylinders the men carry and the amulets carried by the women in ceremonies are sex symbols and are thrown by them into springs or onto ground paintings; or in the women's dance two are dressed as male dancers and shoot arrows into a bundle of cornhusks; or a line of women with yucca rings run in competition with a line of men with kicking sticks. In Peru in a race of exactly similar import, men racing women, the men ran naked and violated every woman they overtook." The pattern is self-evident and common through-out the world, but not in the Southwest. In Zuni there are three occasions on which laxness is countenanced. One of these is in the retreat of the Tlewekwe society, which has power over cold weather. The priestesses of the medicine bundle of this society (*te etone*) and the associated bundle (*mu etone*) during one night receive lovers, and they collect a thumb's length of turquoise from their partners to add to the decorations of their bundles. It is an isolated case in Zuni and the society can no longer be very satisfactorily studied. The other two cases are rather a relaxation of the customary strict chaperonage of the young people, and occur at the ceremonial rabbit hunt" and on the nights of the scalp dance; children conceived on these nights are said to be exceptionally vigorous. Doctor Bunzel<sup>7</sup> writes, "These occasions on which boys and girls dance together or are out together at night provide an opportunity for sweethearts. There is no promiscuity, and *they are* never, never orgiastic in character. There is amiable tolerance of sexual laxity; a 'boys will be boys' attitude." It is all very far in-deed from the common Dionysian sex practices for the sake of fertility.

It is not only in connection with fertility and sex that orgy is common among the peoples of America. In the region immediately surrounding the Southwest, there is on the one hand the orgy of sun dance torturing to the east and the orgy of wholesale destruction in the mourning ceremonies to the west. As I have said, torture plays a very slight role in the Southwest, orgiastic or otherwise. Mourning is made oppressive by fear of the dead, but there is no trace of abandon. Mourning here is made into the semblance of an anxiety complex; it is a completely different thing from the wild scenes of burning the dead in a bonfire of offered property and of clothes stripped from the mourner's backs that the Mohave practice" and that is found in such Dionysian fullness commonly in California, where among the Maidu mourners have to be forcibly restrained from throwing themselves into the flames, and among the Porno they snatch pieces of the corpse and devour them."

One Dionysian ceremony of wide American distribution has established itself in the Southwest-the scalp dance.<sup>18</sup> This is the victory dance of the Plains, or the women's dance, and the position of honor given to women in it, the four-circle coil danced around the encampment, the close-fitting war bonnet, certain treatments of the scalp, are the same in the Southwest as on the Plains. The wilder abandons of the Plains dance are, as we should expect, omitted, but there occurs in this dance, at least in Zuni, one of the few ritual Dionysian acts of the Southwest-the washing and biting of the scalp. For the repulsion against contact with bones or a corpse is intense among these people, so that it makes an occasion for horror out of placing a scalp between the teeth, whereas placing a snake between the teeth in the snake dance is no such matter. The woman who carries the scalp in the dance-the position of honor-must rise to this pitch and every girl is said to dread being called out for the role.

<sup>7</sup> Like many of those that Benedict mentions, Ruth Bunzel (1898-1990) was a student of Boas and a member of Benedict's own circle. She is particularly remembered for her studies of *Zuni* pottery making.

<sup>18</sup> In this passage, Benedict seems to allow that an Apollonian society can include some Dionysian practices. However, this apparent contradiction is resolved by the fact that those who perform the Dionysian act dread participating in it.



Ecstasy and orgy, therefore, which are characteristic of America at large are alien in the Southwest. Let me illustrate this fundamental Apollonian bent in the Southwest by certain specific examples of the way in which it has worked itself out in their culture.

There is considerable emphasis in North America upon the ritualistic eating of filth and it is in this category that the very slightly developed cannibalistic behavior of the Northwest Coast belongs. 'That is, the emphasis there is never, as so often in cannibalism, upon the feast, nor on doing honor to or reviling the dead. The cannibal dance of the Kwakiutl is a typically Dionysian ritual.' It is not only that it is conceived as a dramatization of a condition of ecstasy which the main participant must dance to its climax before he can be restored to normal life; every ritualistic arrangement is designed-I do not mean consciously-to heighten the sense of the anti-natural act. A long period of fasting and isolation precedes the rite, the dance itself is a crouching, ecstatic pursuit of the prepared body held outstretched toward him by a woman attendant. With the required ritualistic bites the anti-natural climax is conceived to be attained, and prolonged vomiting and fasting and isolation follows.

In the filth eating of the Southwest, which is the psychological equivalent to this initiation of the Kwakiutl cannibal, the picture is entirely different. The rite is not used to attain horror, nor to dramatize a psychological climax of tension and release. Captain Bourke has recorded the Newekwe feast he attended with Cushing, at which gallon jars of urine were consumed by the members of the society. The picture is as far from that of the Kwakiutl rite as any buffoonery of our circus clowns. The atmosphere was one of coarse joviality, each man trying to outdo the others. "The dancers swallowed

huge decanters, smacked their lips, and amid the roaring merriment of the spectators, remarked that it was very, very good. The clowns were now upon their mettle, each trying to surpass his neighbors in feats of nastiness."

The same comment is true not only of filth eating but of clowning in the Southwest in general.<sup>20</sup> I take it that the true Dionysian use of clowning is as comic relief in sacred ceremonial where the release from tension is as full of meaning as the preceding tension, and serves to accentuate it. This use of clowning seems to have been developed, for instance, in the ancient Aztec rites. Now I have never seen any clowning in the Pueblos that seemed to me remotely even to partake of this character, and I do not know of any description which would indicate its presence. Clowning can be buffoonery with no Dionysian implications, as we know well enough from the examples in our own civilization. It is this same use that is most prominent in the Southwest, but clowning is used there also for social satire, as in the take-offs of agents, churches, Indian representatives, etc., and it is common too as a substitute for the joking-relationship, which is absent here, and its license for very personal public comment.

Another striking example of the Southwest Apollonian bent is their interpretation of witch power. The Southwest has taken the European witch complex with all its broomsticks and witches' animal suits and eyes laid on a shelf, but they have fitted it into their own *Weltanschauung*. The most articulate statement that I know of a widespread attitude is still in manuscript in Doctor Parson's monograph on Isleta.<sup>21</sup> The difference, for Isleta, between witch power and good power is simply that good supernatural power is always removed from you as soon as you have put it to the use you intended; witch power

<sup>19</sup> Here, as in *Patterns of Culture*, Benedict uses the Kwakiutl as her chief example of a Dionysian culture. In so doing, she relied almost entirely on the work of Boas. She had access not only to Boas' published work, but also to his notebooks and journals. More important, she worked closely with Boas for almost twenty years.

<sup>20</sup> Notice Benedict's use of the first person in this paragraph and below. Her reporting of Pueblo clowning is not

couched in neutral, scientific language; rather she focuses on how things seemed to her. This articulates well with her view of anthropology as an interpretive art.

<sup>21</sup> Benedict draws much of her information on the Pueblos from the work of Parsons, her first teacher, who worked extensively among the Pueblos and published many books on them. Boas and Parsons were very close friends and did some of their research together.

is nonremovable, it rides you for life. Their practice perfectly agrees with this; after every sacred investiture every participant in any rite is desecrated, the unwanted mysterious power is laid aside. Nothing could conceptualize more forcibly their discomfort in the face of mystery. Even the best supernatural power is uncanny.

Their lack of comprehension of suicide is, I think, another specific Apollonian trait. The Pima tell many stories of men who have killed themselves for women, and the Plains made suicide a ceremonial pattern; fundamentally their vows to assume the slit sash were suicide pledges in order to raise their rank. But the Pueblos tell the most inept stories<sup>22</sup> which are obvious misunderstandings of the concept. Again and again I have tried to convey the general idea of suicide to different Pueblo Indians, either by story or by exposition. They always miss the point. Yet in their stories they have the equivalent. There are a number of Zuni stories<sup>23</sup> which tell of a man or woman whose spouse has been unfaithful-or of priests whose people have been unruly; they send messengers, often birds, to the Apache and summon them against their pueblo. When the fourth day has come-nothing ever happens in the South-west till the fourth day-they wash themselves ceremonially and put on their finest costumes and go out to meet the enemy that they may be the first to be killed. When I have asked them about suicide no one has ever mentioned these stories, though they had perhaps been told that very day, and indeed they do not see them in that light at all. They are ritual revenge and the Dionysian gesture of throwing away one's life is not in question.

The cultural situation in the Southwest is in many ways hard to explain.<sup>22</sup> With no natural barriers to isolate it from surrounding peoples, it presents probably the most abrupt cultural break that we know in America. All our efforts to trace out the influences from other areas are impressive for the fragmentariness of the detail; we find bits of the weft or woof of the culture, we do not find any very significant clues to its pattern. From the point of view of the present paper this clue is

to be found in a fundamental psychological set which has undoubtedly been established for centuries in the culture of this region, and which has bent to its own uses any details it imitated from surrounding peoples and has created an intricate cultural pattern to express its own preferences. It is not only that the understanding of this psychological set is necessary for a descriptive statement of this culture; without it the cultural dynamics of this region are unintelligible. For the typical choices of the Apollonian have been creative in the formation of this culture, they have excluded what was displeasing, revamped what they took, and brought into being endless demonstrations of the Apollonian delight in formality, in the intricacies and elaborations of organization.

## NOTES

<sup>1</sup> *Proceedings of the Twenty-third International Congress of Americanists, September 1928 (New York, 1930), 572-81.*

For the theoretical justification of this position in the study of culture see Benedict, Ruth, "Cultures and Psychological Types," *American Anthropologist*, N. S., in press.

<sup>2</sup> I have not followed Nietzsche's definitions in their entirety; I have used that aspect which is pertinent to the problems of the Southwest.

<sup>3</sup> *Birth of Tragedy*, p. 68.

<sup>4</sup> Radin, Paul, "The Winnebago Tribe," *Thirty-seventh Annual Report, Bureau of American Ethnology*, Washington, 1923, 388-426.

pp. 408; 392.

Kroeber, A. L., "The Arapaho," *Bulletin, American Museum of Natural History*, vol. 18, New York, 1907, p. 398.

<sup>5</sup> Kroeber, A. L., "Handbook of the Indians of California," *Bulletin 78, Bureau of American Ethnology*, Washington, 1925, p. 669.

<sup>6</sup> Benedict, Ruth, "A Brief Sketch of Serrano Culture," *American Anthropologist*, N. S., vol. 26, pp. 366-392, 1924, p. 383.

<sup>7</sup> Kroeber, A. L., "Handbook," p. 669.

<sup>8</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 779.

<sup>22</sup> In conclusion, Benedict again declares the fundamental inexplicability of culture. In *Patterns of Culture*, she used a Digger Indian myth to explain cultural origins and

differences: "God gave to every people ... a cup of clay, and from this cup they drank their life. . . . They all dipped in the water but their cups were different" (1934b:33).

- Safford, William E., "Narcotic Daturas of the Old and New World; an Account of Their Remarkable Properties and Their Uses as Intoxicants and in Divination," *Annual Report, Smithsonian Institution for 1920*, pp. 537-567, Washington, 1922, p. 551.
- Stevenson, Matilda C., "The Zuni Indians, Their Mythology, Esoteric Fraternities and Ceremonies," *Twenty-third Annual Report, Bureau of American Ethnology*, Washington, 1904, p. 89.
- Cushing, F. H., "My Experience in Zuni," *Century Magazine*, N. S., 4, p. 31; Stevenson, M. A., *The Zuni Indians*, p. 503. "All are filled with the spirit of good nature."
- Preuss, K. T., *Die Nayarit-Expedition*. Leipzig, 1912, p. 55.
- Voth, H. R., "Oraibi Summer Snake Ceremony," *Field Columbian Museum, Publication 83*. Chicago, 1903, p. 299.
- v See Radin, Paul, *Primitive Man as Philosopher*. New York and London, 1927, pp. 257-275, for discussion of the wide limits of individualism among the Winnebago. 'Except for the war chiefs' societies where it was necessary to have taken a scalp.
- Haeberlin, H. K., "The Idea of Fertilization in the Culture of the Pueblo Indians," *Memoirs, American Anthropological Association*, vol. 3, no. 1, 1916.
- Ibid., especially p. 39 ff.
- Arriaga, P. J., *Extirpation de la Idolotria del Peru*. Lima, 1621, p. 36 sq.
- Information from Dr. Ruth Bunzel.
- Kroeber, "Handbook," p. 750.
- Ibid., p. 431.
- Ibid., p. 253.
- Boas, Franz, "The Social Organization and Secret Societies of the Kwakiutl," *Report, United States National Museum for 1895*, Washington, 1897, p. 537 sq.
- as Bourke, John G., *Compilation of Notes and Memoranda Bearing on the Use of Human Ordure and Human Urine in Rites of a Religious or Semi-religious Character among Various Nations*. Washington, 1888, p. 9.
- Parsons, Elsie Clews, "A Zuni Detective," *Man*, vol. 16, pp. 168-170, London, 1916, p. 169.
- Benedict, R., Mss.